

Impact of Emotional Education programs in the development of emotional competence in secondary students: a scoping review

INPLASY202490009

doi: 10.37766/inplasy2024.9.0009

Received: 2 September 2024

Published: 3 September 2024

Araya, S; Urrutia, M; Chávez-Castillo, Y; Zañartu, I; Zapata-Lamana, R.

Corresponding author:

Mabel Urrutia

maurrutia@udec.cl

Author Affiliation:

Universidad de Concepción.

ADMINISTRATIVE INFORMATION**Support** - Proyecto Exploración 13220040.**Review Stage at time of this submission** - Data extraction.**Conflicts of interest** - None declared.**INPLASY registration number:** INPLASY202490009**Amendments** - This protocol was registered with the International Platform of Registered Systematic Review and Meta-Analysis Protocols (INPLASY) on 3 September 2024 and was last updated on 3 September 2024.**INTRODUCTION**

Review question / Objective The objective of this scoping review will be to evaluate the impact of Emotional Education programs on the development of emotional competencies among secondary students. This review will aim to synthesize the effects of these programs using the PRISMA-ScR methodology, identifying and selecting relevant studies to provide a comprehensive understanding of the phenomenon and highlight the efficacy of social-emotional learning programs in enhancing students' emotional and social skills. Therefore, our research question is: What is the impact of emotional education programs on the development of emotional competencies in secondary students?

Background Emotional competencies will be approached as the ability to employ knowledge, skills, and attitudes to recognize and manage emotions, establish relationships with others, and effectively resolve conflicts (Bisquerra Alzina & Pérez Escoda, 2007; CASEL, 2020; Rebolledo,

2018). The value of emotional competencies lies in their relationship with stronger interpersonal connections (Nelis et al., 2011), increased personal well-being, and academic success (Ciarrochi et al., 2003; Nelis et al., 2011). Furthermore, research demonstrates how emotional competencies are related to resilience, understood as the capacity to recover and positively adapt to adverse situations, as well as to manage stress (Ciarrochi et al., 2003; Nelis et al., 2011).

However, there is a lack of clarity regarding the quality of educational programs designed to incorporate emotional competencies in secondary schools. The importance of emotional education not only emphasizes its benefits but also highlights its effectiveness as a strategy to address significant issues affecting schools and students, particularly in secondary education. Mental health problems (Abdulrahman et al., 2024; Bangalan & Agnes, 2024; Huang et al., 2024; Hunduma et al., 2024), school violence, bullying, and other challenges in school coexistence (Ghardallou et al., 2024), along with substance abuse (Volkow et al.,

2021) and school dropout, remain prevalent concerns both globally and within the Chilean educational context (MINEDUC, 2023; Beroíza-Valenzuela, 2024).

The lack of emotional competencies may exacerbate these issues, contributing to high levels of stress, anxiety, and depression among students. In this context, the study of emotional competencies is key to recognizing and managing emotions, establishing positive relationships, and resolving conflicts constructively (Wilson, 2003). These competencies are crucial in the educational setting for fostering resilience, creating a safe school environment, and preventing aggressive behaviors and mental health issues. Despite this evidence, there is no systematically organized information that considers other variables that might affect the efficiency of emotional education programs, such as gender and socio-economic differences.

Teaching social and emotional skills in schools is as fundamental as developing academic cognitive skills (Sklad et al., 2012). Therefore, the literature will be explored to examine how educational institutions contribute to the personal and social development of students. The types of interventions applied and the extent of limitations in emotional education research in Ibero-American countries will also be analyzed. Although there are original and/or primary studies investigating the benefits of emotional education programs, synthesized information is lacking to consolidate existing findings, identify research gaps, and provide a solid foundation for future interventions and educational policies in the region.

This scoping review will aim to synthesize the impact of various emotional education programs on secondary students. It will include a broader range of programs beyond SEL, considering factors like gender and socio-economic differences to provide a more comprehensive understanding. The review will employ the PRISMA-ScR guidelines to ensure a rigorous and systematic approach.

Rationale The primary objective of this scoping review will be to evaluate the impact of Emotional Education programs on the development of emotional competencies among secondary students. Emotional competencies are essential skills that enable individuals to recognize, understand, express, and regulate emotions, which are critical for personal well-being and academic success. Despite their importance, secondary students often exhibit low levels of emotional

competence, which can lead to various challenges, including mental health issues, school violence, and poor academic performance.

This review will aim to synthesize existing research to determine the effectiveness of emotional education programs in improving these competencies. By examining a broad range of studies, the review will identify the key components and strategies that contribute to successful outcomes in emotional education. It will also highlight the benefits of these programs in fostering social-emotional skills and psychosocial health among secondary students.

A secondary objective will be to address the gaps identified in previous systematic reviews, which have primarily focused on Social-Emotional Learning (SEL) programs. This review will include a wider range of emotional education interventions to provide a comprehensive understanding of their impact. Additionally, it will consider factors such as gender and socio-economic differences to understand how these variables influence the effectiveness of emotional education programs.

The rationale for this review is grounded in the need to support the emotional and social development of secondary students, particularly in the context of increasing mental health concerns and the growing recognition of the importance of emotional competencies in education. By providing a consolidated synthesis of existing research, this review will offer valuable insights for educators, policymakers, and researchers, guiding the implementation and improvement of emotional education programs in secondary schools.

Additionally, the review will aim to address the methodological limitations of previous studies, such as the lack of longitudinal data and the reliance on self-reported measures. By adopting a rigorous and systematic approach, it will be possible to identify areas for future research and enhance existing knowledge.

METHODS

Strategy of data synthesis The search will be restricted to studies published between 2018 and 2023 and will utilize the Web of Science (WOS), Scopus, and Scielo databases. The search will include descriptors in both English and Spanish as follows:

In English: "Emotional Competence" OR "Emotional Learning Programs" AND "secondary school"

In Spanish: "Competencia emocional*" AND "Programas de Educación Emocional" AND "Educación media" OR "Educación Secundaria"

We will review titles and abstracts of the identified studies before examining the full texts. Studies that meet the inclusion criteria and have relevant empirical research will be included in the review. Duplicate documents will be identified using the Rayyan tool based on their DOI and bibliographical reference. Studies whose title, keywords, abstract, and content are not directly related to our research questions or do not meet all previously mentioned inclusion criteria will be excluded.

Eligibility criteria Study Design: Only studies using experimental or quasi-experimental designs that evaluate Emotional Education programs will be included. Observational studies, case reports, and qualitative studies will be excluded unless they provide significant empirical evidence relevant to the research questions.

Participants: The review will include studies focusing on secondary school students, typically aged between 12 and 18 years old. Studies involving participants from other educational stages, such as primary or higher education, will be excluded.

Intervention: Studies must involve Emotional Education programs or social-emotional learning (SEL) interventions aimed at improving emotional competencies. Programs not specifically targeting emotional education will be excluded.

Outcomes: The primary outcomes of interest will be measures of emotional competencies, including but not limited to emotional awareness, emotional regulation, empathy, and interpersonal skills. Secondary outcomes might include academic performance, well-being, and psychosocial health.

Language: Only studies published in English or Spanish will be included to ensure accessibility and comprehensive understanding of the content.

Publication Date: The review will consider studies published within the last five years to ensure the inclusion of recent and relevant evidence.

Geographical Scope: While the review will prioritize studies conducted in Ibero-American countries, it will also include studies from other regions to provide a broader understanding of the impact of Emotional Education programs.

Source of evidence screening and selection

The search will be restricted to studies published between 2018 and 2023 and will utilize the Web of Science (WOS), Scopus, and Scielo databases. The search will include descriptors in both English and Spanish as follows:

In English: "Emotional Competence" OR "Emotional Learning Programs" AND "secondary school"

In Spanish: "Competencia emocional*" AND "Programas de Educación Emocional" AND "Educación media" OR "Educación Secundaria"

We will review titles and abstracts of the identified studies before examining the full texts. Studies that meet the inclusion criteria and have relevant empirical research will be included in the review. Duplicate documents will be identified using the Rayyan tool based on their DOI and bibliographical reference. Studies whose title, keywords, abstract, and content are not directly related to our research questions or do not meet all previously mentioned inclusion criteria will be excluded.

Data management For the selection process, the Rayyan platform (<https://rayyan.ai/>) will be used, a tool widely recognized and used in the scientific community for the review and selection of studies in systematic reviews. Selected articles will be reviewed independently by two reviewers, and any discrepancies will be discussed with a sixth reviewer until agreement is reached. To extract data from the included studies and synthesize the evidence, a standardized table will be performed. A first table will perform a general characterization of the selected studies, reporting information such as the authors, year of publication, country, age of students, sample size, focus, study design, evaluation of the intervention. A second table will include the authors, and year, number of sessions, objective, variables, instruments and result of the emotional education programs in each of the selected articles.

Reporting results / Analysis of the evidence

1. Qualitative Synthesis:

The scoping review will primarily focus on a qualitative synthesis of the existing literature to assess the impact of emotional education programs on the development of emotional competencies in secondary school students. Studies will be reviewed and categorized based on predefined criteria, such as the type of intervention, the emotional competencies assessed, and the study context.

A thematic analysis will be conducted on the qualitative data to identify common patterns across the studies, such as improvements in emotional awareness, emotional regulation, and interpersonal skills. This analysis will help to highlight the strengths and weaknesses of the different programs and understand how they influence students' emotional development.

During the qualitative analysis, gaps in the literature will be identified, such as the lack of studies addressing the long-term sustainability of program effects. These gaps will inform recommendations for future research.

2. Use of Quantitative Data (Subject to Availability):

If the identified studies provide relevant and comparable quantitative data, an additional quantitative analysis will be attempted. The feasibility of conducting this analysis will depend on the quality and consistency of the data available in the selected articles.

Initially, each study will be individually reviewed to evaluate the impact of the programs, using quasi-experimental designs and pre-test/post-test assessments. Significant improvements in emotional competencies will be reported.

If enough studies with comparable quantitative data are found, the review will consider conducting a conditional quantitative analysis, applying effect measures like odds ratios or standardized mean differences. This would involve methods such as inverse variance weighting for pairwise comparisons.

The decision to carry out a formal quantitative analysis will depend on the heterogeneity observed among the studies. If high heterogeneity is present, a more detailed qualitative synthesis may be preferred over quantitative analysis.

Presentation of the results

1. Qualitative Synthesis:

The presentation of results will primarily focus on a qualitative synthesis of the reviewed literature. The selected studies will be categorized based on criteria such as the type of intervention, the emotional competencies evaluated, and the study context. The qualitative results will be presented through a thematic analysis that will highlight common patterns, such as improvements in emotional awareness, emotional regulation, and interpersonal skills. This analysis will allow for the identification and visualization of the strengths and weaknesses of different emotional education programs and their impact on the development of emotional competencies in secondary school students.

2. Use of Quantitative Data (Subject to Availability):

If studies with comparable data are available, the quantitative results will be presented in tables that

include effect measures such as odds ratios or standardized mean differences. These data will be used to conduct a conditional quantitative analysis, provided that heterogeneity among the studies is low. The quantitative results will be displayed using charts that facilitate the comparison of observed improvements in specific emotional competencies across different studies.

Summary Tables:

A table will be created to summarize the included studies, detailing the authors, year of publication, country, sample size, methodological approach, and study design.

An additional table will describe the objectives, evaluated variables, instruments used, and the main results of each study.

Additional Considerations:

Missing or inconsistent data that could influence the interpretation of the results will be documented. These aspects will be discussed in the relevant sections to contextualize the findings and highlight the limitations of the review. Furthermore, if the heterogeneity of the studies is significant, a more detailed qualitative synthesis will be preferred over conducting a formal quantitative analysis.

Language restriction Only studies in English or Spanish were included.

Country(ies) involved The systematic review is being carried out in Chile, involving authors from these country.

Other relevant information

PRISMA Flow

Diagram: Description: A PRISMA (Preferred Reporting Items for Systematic Reviews and Meta-Analyses) flow diagram to illustrate the study selection process from initial search to final inclusion. **Content:** Number of studies identified, screened, excluded, and reasons for exclusion at each stage. **Table of characteristics of included studies: Description:** A detailed table summarizing key characteristics of the included studies.

Content:

- Author(s) year of publication
- Country of origin study
- Design Sample
- Size Population studied
- Interventions assessed
- Main outcomes

Keywords emotional education, emotional competence, social learning, secondary education, scoping review.

Dissemination plans The results of this scoping review will be disseminated through multiple channels to ensure that the findings reach a broad audience, including the academic community, educators, and other stakeholders. The primary dissemination strategy will involve submitting the manuscript for publication in a peer-reviewed scientific journal specializing in educational psychology or emotional competence. This will allow the research to contribute to the ongoing academic discourse and be accessible to researchers and practitioners globally.

In addition to publication, the findings will be presented at national and international conferences, seminars, and workshops related to education, psychology, and emotional development. Presenting at these events will provide an opportunity to engage directly with professionals in the field, receive feedback, and discuss the practical implications of the research.

Contributions of each author

Author 1 - Susana Araya - Drafted the manuscript, conceptualization and design of the study (objectives, research questions and inclusion and exclusion criteria); Search and selection of studies (reviewer 1: by title and abstract, and full text); Data extraction; Analysis and synthesis of the results; Drafting; Review and editing.

Email: susaraya@udec.cl

Author 2 - Mabel Urrutia - Conceptualization and design of the study (objectives, research questions and inclusion and exclusion criteria); Search and selection of studies (reviewer 2: by title and abstract, and full text); Data extraction; Analysis and synthesis of the results; Drafting; Review and editing. Supervision.

Email: maurrutia@udec.cl

Author 3 - Yasna Chavez - Investigation, data curation, writing—review and editing.

Email: yasnasolchavez@udec.cl

Author 4 - Isidora Zanartú - Investigation, data curation, writing—review and editing.

Email: izanartu@udec.cl

Author 5 - Rafael Zapata - Conceptualization and design of the study (objectives, research questions and inclusion and exclusion criteria); Search and selection of studies (reviewer 2: by title and abstract, and full text); Data extraction; Analysis and synthesis of the results; Drafting; Review and editing. Supervision.

Email: rzapatal@santotomas.cl